



STATE COMMISSION ASSESSMENT PANEL

A COMMITTEE OF THE STATE PLANNING COMMISSION

Minutes of the 65th Meeting of the State Commission Assessment Panel held on Day 10th October 2019 commencing at 9.30am ODASA, 28 Leigh St, Adelaide

1. OPENING

1.1. PRESENT

Presiding Member

Simone Fogarty

Members

Dennis Mutton (Deputy Presiding Member)
Chris Branford
Peter Dungey
Sally Roberts

Secretary

Jessie Surace

DPTI Staff

Simon Neldner (Agenda Item 3.2.1)
Laura Kerber (Agenda Item 3.2.1)
Will Gormly (agenda Item 3.2.1, 2.1.1, 2.2.1)
Brianna Fyffe (Agenda Item 3.2.1)
Byron Turner (Agenda Item 3.2.1)
Greg Wise (Agenda Item 3.2.1)

1.2. APOLOGIES

Mark Adcock

2. SCAP APPLICATIONS

2.1. DEFERRED APPLICATIONS

2.1.1 Scott Salisbury Group

110/M010/18

19 to 20 Adelphi Terrace and 9 to 15 Tod Street Glenelg North

City of Holdfast Bay

Proposal: Construction of five residential flat buildings, comprising one 7 level building facing Adelphi Terrace with 6 levels of apartments (46 apartments) and ground level car parking and roof plant; and four 2 storey buildings to the east of the site, comprising 17 dwellings with associated integrated car parking.

Chris Branford declared a conflict of interest (due to involvement in the development as a consultant) and left the meeting.

The Presiding Member welcomed all in attendance to the State Commission Assessment Panel hearing:

Applicants

- Chris Branford, Branford Planning and Design - presented
- Kendall Aplin, Aplin Cook Gardener – presented
- Marlew Cook, Aplin Cook Gardener
- David Kwong, GTA Traffic
- Scott Salisbury, Scott Salisbury Group

Agency

- Belinda Chan, ODASA
- Aya Shirai-Doull, ODASA

The applicant presented a 3D fly through of the site.

The State Commission Assessment Panel discussed the application.

RESOLVED

1. That the proposed development is NOT seriously at variance with the policies in the Development Plan.
2. That the State Commission Assessment Panel is satisfied that the proposal generally accords with the related Objectives and Principles of Development Control of the Holdfast Bay Council Development Plan.
3. To grant Development Plan Consent to the proposal by Scott Salisbury Group C/ Branford Planning & Design for Development Application 110/M010/18 for the construction of five (5) residential flat buildings, comprising one seven level building facing Adelphi Terrace with 6 levels of apartments (46 apartments) and ground level car parking and roof plant; and four 2 storey buildings comprising 17 dwellings with associated integrated car parking at 19- 20 Adelphi Terrace and 9 – 15 Tod Street, Glenelg North, subject to the following reserved matter and conditions of consent.

Taking into consideration the size and configuration of the site, the SCAP considered this application to warrant approval in particular for the following reasons:

- The restrained and appropriate transition between the Residential High Density Zone and the adjacent Residential Character Zone;
- The overall integrated design of the western building including the recessive nature of the additional floors achieved by:
 - Simple elegant form
 - Adequate set back
 - Appropriate colours and materials
- An integrated site design that provides access to two street frontages, minimising impacts on residential streets;
- A considered contribution to the public realm through a generous set-back, landscaping and integration with the streetscape; and
- Minimal impact on privacy, overlooking and overshadowing on the adjacent zone

RESERVED MATTER

1. Provision of a detailed landscaping plan which provides additional screening to the ground level car park walls on the western elevation in addition to the public realm contribution.

PLANNING CONDITIONS

1. That except where minor amendments may be required by other relevant Acts, or by conditions imposed by this application, the development shall be established in strict accordance with the details and plans submitted in Development Application No 110/M010/18.

Reason for condition: To ensure the development is undertaken in accordance with endorsed plans and application details.

2. The applicant shall construct the development in accordance with the materials and finishes provided as part of the schedule of external materials and finishes submitted to State Commission Assessment Panel, unless otherwise amended by the SCAP.

Reason for condition: To ensure the development is constructed with high quality materials and finishes.

3. Prior to Development Approval for substructure works of the apartment building facing Adelphi Terrace, the applicant shall submit details of the aluminium metal cladding, including cladding panel layout, corner junctions, joint and fixing details, to ensure the clean and refined expression of the solid projecting frames and balcony edges as indicated by the 3D visualisations, in consultation with the Government Architect to the reasonable satisfaction of State Commission Assessment Panel.

Reason for condition: To ensure the development is constructed in accordance with approved plans.

4. All internal ramps and car parking areas shall be designed and constructed in accordance with AS/NZS 2890.1:2004 and 2890.6:2009.

Reason for condition: To ensure safe operation of the car parking associated with the development.

5. All off-street car parking areas shall be designed in accordance with AS/NZS 2890.1:2004 and AS/NZS 2890.6:2009.

Reason for condition: to ensure off-street car parking facilities are designed to adhere to the necessary standards.

6. All bicycle facilities shall be designed in accordance with AS/NZS 2890.3:2015.

Reason for condition: to ensure bicycle facilities are designed to adhere to the necessary standard.

7. The development will comply with noise level criteria specified in Environmental Protection (Noise) Policy 2007 (under the Environmental Protection Act). This includes noise from roof-level plant and equipment and the air-conditioning units with consideration given to the adjacent properties. Noise attenuation devices and visual screening will be implemented as necessary.

Reason for condition: to ensure mechanical equipment does not cause unreasonable nuisance or loss of amenity in the locality.

8. All Council, utility or state-agency maintained infrastructure (i.e. roads, kerbs, drains, crossovers, footpaths etc.) that is demolished, altered, removed or damaged during the construction of the development shall be reinstated to Council, utility or state agency specifications. All costs associated with these works shall be met by the proponent.

Reason for condition: to ensure appropriate reinstatement of any Council, utility or state-agency maintained infrastructure affected by construction activities.

9. The stormwater system shall be designed to ensure that post development stormwater flows do not exceed pre-development stormwater flow and that the system can cater for a 10 year rainfall event. Detailed stormwater plans and calculations of pre and post development stormwater flow shall be submitted to the City of Holdfast Bay for approval prior to Development Approval and be to the reasonable satisfaction of the Council.

Reason for condition: To ensure that adequate provision is made for the collection and dispersal of stormwater.

10. Landscaping shown on the approved plans shall be established prior to the operation of the development and shall be maintained and nurtured at all times, with any diseased or dying plants being replaced.

Reason for condition: To ensure the development maintains its appearance.

11. All external lighting on the site shall be designed and constructed to conform to Australian Standard (AS 4282-1997).

Reason for condition: to ensure external lighting does not introduce undue potential for hazards to users of the adjacent road network in accordance with the necessary standard.

ADVISORY NOTES

- a. This Development Plan Consent will expire after 12 months from the date of this Notification, unless final Development Approval from Council has been received within that period or this Consent has been extended by the State Commission Assessment Panel.
- b. The applicant is also advised that any act or work authorised or required by this Notification must be substantially commenced within 3 years of the final Development Approval issued by Council and substantially completed within 5 years of the date of final Development Approval issued by Council, unless that Development Approval is extended by the Council.
- c. The applicant has a right of appeal against the conditions which have been imposed on this Development Plan Consent. Such an appeal must be lodged at the Environment, Resources and Development Court within two months from the day of receiving this notice or such longer time as the Court may allow. The applicant is asked to contact the Court if wishing to appeal. The Court is located in the Sir Samuel Way Building, Victoria Square, Adelaide, (telephone number 8204 0289).
- d. Signage does not form part of this development application. No advertising display or signage shall be erected or displayed on the subject land without any required Development Approval being obtained first.
- e. The applicant is reminded of their obligations under the *Local Nuisance and Litter Control Act 2016* and the *Environment Protection Act 1993*, with regard to the appropriate management of environmental impacts and matters of local nuisance. For further information about appropriate management of construction sites, please contact the City of Holdfast Bay.

2.2. NEW APPLICATIONS

2.2.1 Delta Projects

155/M006/17 V1

25 College Road, Kent Town

City of Norwood Payneham and St Peters

Proposal: Variation to DA 155/M006/17 being for the addition of one level to Building 1 (level 6) and internal floor plan reconfiguration of levels 3-5.

The Presiding Member welcomed all in attendance to the State Commission Assessment Panel hearing:

Applicants

- Garth Heynen, Heynen Planning Consultants - presented
- David Cargill, Delta Projects
- Daniel Giustozzi, Delta Projects

Agency

- Aya Shirai-Doull, ODASA

Representor

- David Hutchison – presented

The State Commission Assessment Panel discussed the application.

RESOLVED

1. That the proposed development is NOT seriously at variance with the policies in the Development Plan.
2. To refuse Development Plan Consent to the proposal by Delta Projects for the variation to DA 155/M006/17 being for the addition of one level to Building 1 (level 6) and internal floor plan reconfiguration for approved levels 3-5 at 25 College Road, Kent Town.

Whilst it is acknowledged that, taken in isolation, a single additional storey to a portion of a medium-rise development could be considered as relatively minor, this proposal needs to be considered in its entirety. Noting that the proposal has already been granted approval for over height development, an additional over height element is considered to be on balance, unacceptable, particularly in regard to the following:

- The proposed development exceeds the maximum height of 5 storeys and 18.5 metres defined within the Desired Character of the High Street Policy Area of the Urban Corridor Zone, and PDC 13 of the Urban Corridor Zone.
- The development does not accord with the Desired Character of the Urban Corridor Zone, which seeks lower scale and intensity along minor streets.
- The car parking rates proposed do not accord with the requirements of Table NPSP/9A of the Development Plan.

2.3. RESERVED MATTERS - Nil

3. CROWN DEVELOPMENTS (ADVISORY ITEMS)

3.1. DEFERRED APPLICATIONS – Nil

3.2. NEW APPLICATIONS

3.2.1 Department of Planning, Transport and Infrastructure

170/V002/19

Lot 100 Junction Road, Paradise

City of Campbelltown

Proposal: Upgrade the Paradise Park'n'Ride comprising: a) construction of a single deck car park; b) alterations and additions to at-grade car parking; c) reconfigured access and egress; d) pedestrian and cycle access paths; cycle storage facilities; and landscaping; e) removal of seven (7) regulated trees; and f) tree-damaging activities to one (1) regulated tree and two (2) significant trees.

The Presiding Member welcomed all in attendance to the State Commission Assessment Panel hearing:

Applicants

- Leigh Dalwood, Public Transport Projects Alliance
- Orr Shallev, Public Transport Projects Alliance - presented
- Brett Pendlebury, Public Transport Projects Alliance
- Jon Whelan, DPTI - presented
- Gemma Kirnich, DPTI

Council

- Nigel Litchfield, City of Campbelltown

Agency:

- Ellen Liebelt, ODASA
- Mark Adams, ODASA
- Matthew Henderson, DPTI

Member of the Public

- Winnie Zian

The Department presented a 3D digital model of the site.

The applicant presented a sample of the façade aluminium screen (not submitted formally as a part of the application).

The State Commission Assessment Panel discussed the application.

RESOLVED

That the State Commission Assessment Panel provide its recommendation in confidence (included in SCAP Confidential Minutes – 10 October 2019) to the Minister for Planning, in relation to the proposal by the Department of Planning, Transport and Infrastructure for Lot 100 Junction Road, Paradise.

Note: a Decision Notification Form will be forwarded to all representors once the Minister has made a decision on the application.

4. MAJOR DEVELOPMENTS – VARIATIONS - Nil

5. OTHER BUSINESS - Nil

6. **NEXT MEETING**

6.1. Thursday 24 October 2019 at ODASA, 28 Leigh Street, Adelaide SA 5000

7. **CONFIRMATION OF THE MINUTES OF THE MEETING**

7.1. **RESOLVED** that the Minutes of this meeting held today be confirmed.

8. **MEETING CLOSE**

The Presiding Member thanked all in attendance and closed the meeting at 2.53pm.

Confirmed 10/10/2019

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Simone Fogarty', written in a cursive style. The signature is positioned above a dotted line.

.....
Simone Fogarty
PRESIDING MEMBER